

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
TRANSPORT COMMITTEE
HELD ON FRIDAY, 9 NOVEMBER 2018 AT COMMITTEE ROOM A,
WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS**

Present:

Councillor Kim Groves (Chair)	Leeds City Council
Councillor Eric Firth (Deputy Chair)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Martyn Bolt (Leader of the Opposition)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Peter Box CBE	Wakefield Council
Councillor Kayleigh Brooks	Leeds City Council
Councillor Neil Buckley	Leeds City Council
Councillor Peter Caffrey	Calderdale Council
Councillor David Dagger	Wakefield Council
Councillor Peter Dew	City of York Council
Councillor Michael Ellis	Bradford Council
Councillor Manisha Kaushik	Kirklees Council
Councillor Hassan Khan	Bradford Council
Councillor Michael Lyons OBE	Leeds City Council
Councillor Daniel Sutherland	Calderdale Council
Councillor Kevin Swift	Wakefield Council
Ian Cherry	Nexus Vehicle Management

In attendance:

Councillor Barry Collins	Calderdale Council
Councillor Richard Lewis	Leeds City Council
Councillor Peter McBride	Kirklees Council
Councillor Alex Ross-Shaw	Bradford Council
Richard Crisp	CRESR, Sheffield Hallam University (minute 37 only)
Ed Ferrari	CRESR, Sheffield Hallam University (minute 37 only)
Dave Pearson	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Alan Reiss	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Tom Gifford	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Noel Collings	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Alistair Ryder	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Ruth Chaplin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

32. Chair's Comments

The Committee observed a two minute silence in an act of remembrance marking 100 years since the end of World War One.

The Chair welcomed Alan Reiss, Director of Policy, Strategy and Communications who had recently joined the Combined Authority.

33. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Ian Greenwood and Taj Salam.

34. Declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests

Councillor Ellis declared an other interest as he is a member of the Regional Flood and Coastal Committee and Airedale Drainage Commission.

35. Exempt information - possible exclusion of the press and public

There were no items requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

36. Minutes of the meeting of the Transport Committee held on 21 September 2018.

Further to minute 27, Responses to formal rail consultations: Cross Country consultation, Councillor Swift asked that the final sentence be amended to include that the delay in rectifying the capacity issues was due to insufficient rolling stock on the Cross Country route and this should be addressed at the earliest opportunity.

Further to minute 29, City Connect Cycle Ambition Programme (CCAG) Phase 1, Councillor Buckley expressed concern that this item had been considered before the outcome of the adjudication was known. As he wished to provide some further information he had received in respect of the adjudication, the press and public were excluded from the meeting during this discussion as it related to the appendix to the report previously considered which had been exempt under paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A to the Local Government Act 1972.

Resolved: That the minutes of the Transport Committee held on 21 September 2018 be deferred until the next meeting and clarification on additional information provided in respect of minute 29 be sought from officers.

37. West Yorkshire Combined Authority Response to Joseph Rowntree Foundation Report

The Transport Committee considered a report and was given a presentation on the Joseph Rowntree Foundation (JRF) report, 'Tackling Transport-Related Barriers to Employment in Low Income Neighbourhoods'.

The meeting was attended by Richard Crisp and Ed Ferrari from the Centre for

Regional Economic and Social Research (CRESR) at Sheffield Hallam University. They presented the findings of the report which considered transport to be a key barrier to employment for many residents living in low-income neighbourhoods.

Members welcomed the report and supported its recommendations and conclusions, particularly the need to implement bus franchising or partnership models, the development of longer term spatial planning frameworks and tools and the inclusion of housing and planning policy.

Comment was made that there were no impact maps included for Seacroft or Dewsbury Moor and, whilst the focus of the report was on public transport, it was considered that cycling initiatives such as the cycle superhighway, City Connect and Streetbikes should be recognised as helping to overcome transport barriers. It was noted that other areas of work were being carried out to help address some of the challenges highlighted in the Joseph Rowntree report. This included ways of improving transport links in order to get people to work and it was suggested that businesses be encouraged to locate to areas outside city centres. A review of the West Yorkshire bus network was being undertaken to highlight areas where networks no longer connect to employment areas and also the possibility of working with bus operators to facilitate trials of demand responsive services.

The Committee thanked Richard Crisp and Ed Ferrari for their report, presentation and discussion.

Resolved: That a letter be sent to the Department for Transport suggesting national initiatives to address the issues raised in the report.

38. Future of Bus 18

The Transport Committee considered a report which provided an update on Bus 18 and the proposed next steps for moving towards a formal alliance with bus operators.

It was noted that the Combined Authority and local authorities are committed to increasing bus patronage and need to work closely with bus companies to address issues with bus service availability, affordability and social economic needs. The report summarised a proposal to move towards a non-statutory alliance (a voluntary partnership) with bus operators with a view to migrating to a statutory partnership model as it matures. Whilst supporting the proposal, some Members advocated a move towards franchising but it was acknowledged that only metro mayoral regions (and Cornwall, because of its devolution deal) had the power to adopt a franchising model.

Members discussed the proposal including the heads of terms and delivery plan which would set out what customers can expect by 2021. This would tie closely to the timescales set for the investment programmes and matches the Combined Authority's budget plan and programme to transform its interventions in the bus services.

A further report would be brought to the next meeting.

Resolved: That the heads of terms and delivery plan of an alliance between the Combined Authority and bus operators be developed and a report brought to the next meeting of the Transport Committee for adoption.

39. Planning for Growth: The Leeds City Region Connectivity Strategy

The Transport Committee considered a report on Planning for Growth: The Leeds City Region Connectivity Strategy which:

- Provided an update on the ongoing development of the Inclusive Growth Corridor Programme which will help shape the future connectivity pipeline across all modes of transport serving the Leeds City Region.
- Sought endorsement for the commencement of a conversation with the public and stakeholders around the new 21st century connectivity and services technologies required to address the economic and transport challenges facing West Yorkshire, to complement future strategic infrastructure including HS2 and Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR).
- Sought approval for establishing a member working group to oversee the development of the emerging City Region Transit Network.

The report set out and developed the first tranche of Inclusive Growth Corridors as identified in the HS2 Connectivity Strategy and how transforming connectivity will help to deliver Inclusive Growth.

Members noted the current investment in transport across West Yorkshire and York and the significant improvements already being made through the Connecting Leeds programme and the West Yorkshire plus Transport Fund across walking, cycling, bus and rail.

The Committee discussed the importance of Leeds City Region's future connectivity needs including the possible requirement for a mass transit system. Whilst no commitment was being made at this stage to develop a mass transit system and more work would need to be undertaken around demand and a business case analysis, it was proposed to open a conversation on solutions to future capacity requirements and delivering inclusive growth. It was reported that, subject to any feedback, the proposed City Region Transit Network has the potential to form a key priority for delivery in the timeframe up to HS2 opening in 2033.

Members welcomed the proposals for consultation with the public and stakeholders. However they were concerned that the maps provided in respect of the initial proposals for the three new services did not refer to Calderdale and parts of Kirklees. They stressed that the new transport routes must be evidence based and provide benefits to the whole region.

It was proposed that a member working group be established to oversee the significant development work which is required on the City Region Transit Network. The draft terms of reference for the group were attached at Appendix 6 and it was agreed that all members of the Transport Committee and each district's portfolio holder would be able to attend the meetings.

Resolved:

- (i) That the ongoing development of the Inclusive Growth Corridor Programme which will help to shape the future connectivity pipeline for the Leeds City Region be noted.
- (ii) That the Transport Committee endorse commencing a conversation with the public and stakeholders around the new 21st century connectivity services and technologies required to address the economic and transport challenges facing West Yorkshire, to complement future strategic infrastructure including HS2 and Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR).
- (iii) That a member working group be established to oversee the development of the emerging City Region Transit Network.

40. Transforming Cities Fund

The Transport Committee considered a report on the Transforming Cities Fund (TCF) which:

- Provided an update on Transforming Cities Fund.
- Sought endorsement to the continuation of the Transforming Cities Fund member working group sessions to oversee the development of the Transforming Cities Fund stage 2 submission.

It was reported that the Transforming Cities Fund had been updated in the recent Budget announcement and the government had now made a total of £1.28 billion available and extended the period to 2022-23. The key points arising from the announcement were outlined in the submitted report which had included confirmation that West Yorkshire had been successful in reaching stage two of the application process.

The Combined Authority's bid on behalf of the Leeds City Region for stage 1 had focussed around 3 themes and detailed proposals now need to be developed for the stage 2 submission in collaboration with Leeds City Region stakeholders, officers and members. A 'task and finish' working group had been set up to shape the stage 1 submission and it was proposed to continue with this approach for the development of stage 2 but to widen the representation to include North Yorkshire authorities.

Resolved:

- (i) That the progression of the Leeds City Region Transforming Cities Fund bid to the stage 2 co-development phase be noted.
- (ii) That the Transport Committee endorse regular member working group sessions to be set up to support the development of the Leeds City Region stage 2 Transforming Cities Fund bid.

41. Rail Performance and Future Service Planning Update

The Transport Committee considered a report on rail performance and future service planning which:

- Provided an update on the performance of local rail services following discussion at the previous meeting.
- Advised Members of progress with the reviews into rail performance and governance following the issues emerging in May 2018.
- Advised Members of arrangements proposed to improve engagement between the Combined Authority and the rail industry.
- Provided an update on the service planning for the forthcoming timetable changes.
- Sought agreement to actions to highlight the Combined Authority's ongoing concerns at service delivery issues in the region and to seek urgent interventions to address them.

Members reiterated concerns previously raised that services were still failing to operate at an acceptable level and that the rail operators were not fulfilling their franchise obligations.

The report provided an update on the service planning for the forthcoming timetable changes and Members were extremely concerned that the rail industry, led by Network Rail, had made the decision that the December 2018 timetable will have only very limited service changes designed to improve punctuality and reliability. The Chair advised the meeting that she had met with Northern to discuss the priorities for short-term service intervention and had stressed that the Combined Authority want Northern to remain open to altering in May 2019 any changes made in December 2018, such as those on the Leeds – York corridor which the Combined Authority opposes. Comment was made that any improvements would be minimal and would not address the ongoing problems and that many committed service enhancements which should have been introduced in December 2017 would now face an even longer delay. Members were also concerned about the lack of consultation on the latest timetable announcements from Northern. Information was still awaited from Transpennine Express and a letter will be sent to Transport for the North and the Department for Transport on the urgent need to rectify the issues.

In respect of rail reviews, Members welcomed the involvement of Roger Marsh, Chair of the Leeds City Region Enterprise Partnership and the NP11 Board in the major review of the UK rail industry launched by the Secretary of State.

It was reported that Councillor Judith Blake, as the Combined Authority's representative, had agreed to raise the Combined Authority's serious concerns at the Transport for the North Rail North Committee and she had assured Members that the voice of the City Region would be strongly and firmly heard at both the TfN Rail North Committee and nationally.

It was proposed to establish a joint forum to enable the Combined Authority Members, train operators, Network Rail, Transport for the North and other key

bodies to discuss plans and issues affecting local rail services and the terms of reference were attached at Appendix 2.

A further report would be brought to the next meeting.

Resolved:

- (i) That the update on the current rail service performance be noted and that Councillor Judith Blake, as the Combined Authority's representative on the Transport for the North Rail North Committee, raises through that Committee the Authority's concerns about the impact of prolonged rail disruption, and urge further action to restore rail performance to the level required by the respective franchises.
- (ii) That the establishment of a West Yorkshire Combined Authority Rail Forum, as outlined in the submitted report, be endorsed.
- (iii) That the Combined Authority's input into the Blake Johnson Review be noted.
- (iv) That the Chair of the Combined Authority writes to Arriva Rail North highlighting concerns that the December 2018 rail timetable will not address pressing service delivery issues on critical routes in West Yorkshire, and seeking action to address these as a priority.
- (v) That the Transport Committee notes the risk associated with delivery of the 2019 timetable commitments as a consequence of network capacity constraints, and the work to be undertaken to understand this and the possible compromises which may be required. Further information will be presented at the January 2019 meeting.

42. NPR Update

The Transport Committee considered a report which provided an update on the progress being made on the development of the Northern Powerhouse Rail (NPR) programme.

Members noted the background to NPR and the Combined Authority's priorities for Transport for the North and endorsed the key issues for West Yorkshire in the development of the Strategic Outline Business Case for NPR.

It was noted that working closely with City of Bradford Council, the Combined Authority had commissioned further work in respect of the economic and strategic case for NPR to serve Bradford and the main conclusions were outlined in the submitted report.

Resolved:

- (i) That the key priorities for NPR outlined in paragraph 1.11 of the submitted report be endorsed and that these priorities are pressed for through the Combined Authority's representatives on TfN's Partnership Board.

- (ii) That the conclusions of recent studies relating to NPR serving Bradford be noted and their use in making the case for a city centre station in Bradford, as outlined in paragraphs 1.12 – 1.14 of the submitted report be endorsed.

43. Transport for the North Integrated and Smart Travel Programme Update

The Transport Committee considered a progress report on Transport for the North Integrated and Smart Travel Programme which sought endorsement for the signing of the Memorandum of Understanding which was required to enable progress of the Phase 2 Full Business Case.

Members noted the current position of the Programme and the proposals for Phase 2 which were detailed in the submitted report.

The Department for Transport (DfT) have requested that TfN attached a signed Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), to the Full Business Case. It was noted that signing the MoU does not commit the Combined Authority to provide specific funding and no costs will be incurred as a result of signing the MoU. It would however enable the Combined Authority to be involved in the development of Phase 2 initiatives and use them to trial the new information tools for one year prior to committing to any funding of their ongoing operation. A copy of the Memorandum of Understanding will be circulated to Members.

Resolved:

- (i) That the progress of the Transport for the North's Integrated and Smart Travel Programme be noted.
- (ii) That the Transport Committee noted the Combined Authority entering into a Memorandum of Understanding with Transport for the North to trial the new information tools and a copy of the Memorandum of Understanding be circulated to Members.

44. Air Quality Update

The Transport Committee considered a report which provided an update on air quality issues and related activities taking place across the region.

Information and updates were provided on the following:

- DEFRA direction for improvement in Bradford Nitrogen Dioxide levels
- Clean Bus Technology Fund delivery
- WYLES Delivery Resourcing
- ULEV Taxi Scheme
- Transport Research Innovation Fund – Cycling Emission Exposure Project

Members discussed progress towards the West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy (WYLES) and the need to reduce emissions from the transport sector

to contribute to the overall strategy to improve air quality. The Committee requested greater clarity on progress being made towards a target set for 2020 [To check with Alistair Ryder]. It was reported that Kirklees Council have received funding through the DEFRA Air Quality grant to provide a dedicated resource to deliver the recommendations of the WYLES. The post holder will be based part-time within the Combined Authority and will report progress on delivery of the strategy to the Committee on a quarterly basis, including current monitoring results.

It was reported that Kirklees Council had recently considered 'moss tree' technology which can be used to filter out pollutants to help improve air quality and further information would be sought on this initiative.

The Committee was advised that multiple publically owned car park sites for installation of taxi charge points for the Ultra-Low Emission Taxi Scheme (ULEV) have been nominated by partner councils and installation was due to commence in Spring 2019.

It was suggested that as both the Transport Committee and West Yorkshire & York Investment Committee consider air quality initiatives it may be beneficial for a joint meeting to be held to discuss all opportunities for intervention.

Resolved: That the report be noted.

45. Energy Strategy and Delivery Plan

The Transport Committee considered a report on the Energy Strategy and Delivery Plan (ESDP).

It was noted that the ESDP would contribute to achieving the key challenges of the Local Inclusive Industrial Strategy and was made up of the following four work packages:

- Energy state of the Leeds City Region
- Technology Options Appraisal
- Energy Opportunity Areas
- Delivery Plan

A summary of each package was set out in the submitted report.

In respect of the science based targets, it was noted that further work would be undertaken to help the Leeds City Region Local Enterprise Partnership and Combined Authority consider adopting a regional target.

Resolved: That the report be noted.

46. Green and Blue Infrastructure Strategy and Delivery Plan

The Transport Committee considered a report on the development of the Leeds City Region Green and Blue Infrastructure Strategy and Delivery Plan.

It was reported that the strategy was a named delivery plan of the Strategic Economic Plan (SEP) and is aligned with current thinking on the emerging Local Inclusive Industrial Strategy and policy framework for the City Region. This had been split into two elements, the strategy and the delivery plan.

Members welcomed the strategy and it was noted that approval would be sought at the next meetings of the LEP Board and Combined Authority.

Resolved: That the report and draft Green and Blue Infrastructure Strategy and Delivery Plan be noted.

47. Local Transport Plan Approvals

The Transport Committee considered a report on Local Transport Plan approvals.

Members discussed a proposal for the progression of, and funding for the Bus Shelter Advertising Panel Lighting Conversion project. This was a West Yorkshire Combined Authority supported Local Transport Fund funded project and details of the scheme were outlined in the submitted report and a summary of the business case was attached at Appendix 2.

Resolved:

- (i) That the Bus Shelter Advertising Panel Lighting Conversion project proceeds through decision point 5, and moves to activity 6, Delivery.
- (ii) That the total project value of £282,726 is approved from the Local Transport Plan (LTP) (Implementation Plan 3, 2017-2022).
- (iii) That future approvals are made in accordance with the approval pathway and approval route outlined in the submitted report, subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances presented.

48. Budget Planning

The Transport Committee considered a report on issues to be considered in the business planning process and revenue budget planning for 2019/20.

The initial budget proposal for 2019/20 was being prepared assuming the continuation of the £1 million pa reduction in the Transport Levy. The Budget Working Group is exploring where further savings can be made additional to the levy reduction plan and would require a reduction on the services which are overseen by the Transport Committee.

The Combined Authority will set the 2019/20 budget at its meeting on 14 February 2019.

Resolved: That the approach to setting the 2019/20 revenue budget and medium term financial strategy as set out in the submitted report be endorsed.

49. Leeds City Region Transport Update

The Transport Committee considered a report which provided an update on the following issues as set out in paragraphs 2.1 to 2.65 of the submitted report:

- House of Commons Transport Select Committee Inquiries
- Future Mobility Call for Evidence
- Calder Valley Line Upgrade
- Platform extensions programme
- Local cycling and walking infrastructure plans
- Walking and cycling issues
- Connecting Leeds update
- Highways England Designated Funds programme
- EU Interreg funding bid
- Statement of Common Ground
- Leeds City Region Planning Review
- Transport for the North
- HS2

The report provided the Committee with a detailed update on each of the above issues.

Resolved: That the updates provided in the report be noted.

50. Summary of Transport Schemes

The Transport Committee considered a report which provided information on the transport related West Yorkshire and York Investment Committee (the Investment Committee) recommendations arising out of its meeting held on 5 September 2018.

The following projects had been considered at the meeting:

- Calderdale multi-modal transport model
- Corridor Improvement Programme – Phase 1 – A62 Smart Corridor, Kirklees
- Glasshoughton southern link road, Wakefield
- Leeds New Station Street improvements
- Rail Park & Ride Programme – Phase 1 – Hebden Bridge
- Door to door transport digital hub, Leeds

The recommendations for the above projects had been approved at the West Yorkshire Combined Authority meeting on 11 October 2018 or delegated for approval to the Combined Authority's Managing Director.

Resolved: That the report be noted.